

Care For Your Area Services – Efficiency, Improvement and Transformation Review.

Care for Your Area is an umbrella organisation that provides a large number of different front line services. The scope of this review is to consider the following services: Refuse Collection, Street Cleansing, Horticultural Services, Urban Parks, Recycling Services, Markets, Public Conveniences and Workshops and Vehicle Maintenance. This review will consider each of these separate services in turn. Other services that fall within CFYA that are subject to previous and ongoing reviews include Commercial Waste Services, Highway Maintenance, Countryside Parks, Bulky Household Waste.

KERBSIDE RECYCLING COLLECTION

| Service Baseline / Initial Challenge | Guidance | Information |
|---|---------------------------|---|
| Description of Current Service | Who provides the service? | <p>This service is provided through an in-house service provision by Care For Your Area based at Cowpen Lane Depot, Billingham.</p> <p>The kerbside recycling collection service operates on a fortnightly basis to around 82,000 properties.</p> <p>Every household across the borough is issued with a blue box and blue bag for recycling, where there are multiple properties (such as High rise flats/large communal areas) larger containers for communal recycling are provided.</p> <p>Residents who are elderly or physically unable to bring their recycling to the kerbside receive an assisted collection service.</p> <p>This service collects a number of dry materials from the kerbside, residents can recycle brown, green and clear glass, tins</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | | <p>(including foil) in the blue box and paper in the blue bag.</p> <p>The service is provided by six HGV kerbside vehicles each having one driver and two loaders and one open back vehicle.</p> <p>A separate vehicle operated by one driver provides the recycling service to farms collecting plastic and cardboard recycling and green waste, all of which is sorted into separate containers on the vehicle during collection.</p> <p>The service currently has two additional reserve kerbside vehicles which are used as contingency when vehicles have scheduled repairs and also in times of increased tonnage collections – such as during the Christmas festive period.</p> <p>There is also an additional transit vehicle used to deliver recycling containers. At the moment residents can receive replacement or additional recycling containers free of charge.</p> <p>Households that have communal recycling facilities, such as high rise flats, sheltered accommodation schemes and some flats have larger containers provided as communal recycling facilities, these containers are emptied on an agreed frequency (some daily, some weekly some fortnightly) depending on the usage. A partnership arrangement with an external recycling company currently exists, this company collects all recycling from</p> |
|--|--|--|

| | | |
|----------|---|---|
| | | communal containers. |
| Baseline | History - how was the service formed and why does it exist? | <p>Only a few years ago, Stockton's waste services were limited, with traditional refuse collection arrangements only until 2002. With the increasing emphasis on the effects of the waste stream on the environment the government introduced targets for recycling waste. Initially provided by an external contractor, recycling collections of paper and tins commenced, though the service was only available to around half of the households in the borough.</p> <p>The Service was very poor, with frequent missed collections and spillages that the Council was responding to on behalf of the contractor.</p> <p>Ultimately, the contractor was unable to fulfil their contractual obligations and the service was brought back 'in house' in 2004. Since then and following several Scrutiny reviews, the Council's recycling provision has continued to expand with Green Waste starting in 2005 and plastic and cardboard collections in 2009.</p> <p>Recently, the service underwent a significant workforce reconfiguration and modernisation exercise. Generic job descriptions and flexible working hours were introduced. As part of the Scrutiny review, a no side waste and one wheelie bin policy was</p> |

| | | |
|-----------|--|---|
| | | <p>adopted also and this has had a positive effect and acted as an incentive for residents to recycle and reduced the amount of waste in the waste stream, without any detrimental impact on fly tipping.</p> |
| Challenge | <p>What influences impact on the service? (political, social economical, technological)</p> | <p>Recycling remains high on the government's agenda and a waste review is again under way. Several industries on Teesside are developing bio-fuel and other green energies that may require a review of waste collection and disposal methods in the coming years.</p> |
| | <p>How does the service perform?</p> | <p>Stockton's kerbside recycling collection service – part of the wider CFYA Services - is nationally recognised as being one of the country's top performing services.</p> <p>The industry is measured by a '<i>missed bins per 100,000</i>' collections indicator. (BVPI 88) for refuse collection which has been established for recycling collections also</p> <p>Stockton's performance is less than one bin missed per 100,000 collections which is in the top quartile of performance.</p> <p>Customer Satisfaction ratings for recycling in 2010/11 is 93.08%</p> <p>NI 192 which Kerbside recycling feeds into has also remained on the newly introduced</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | | <p>Single Data List. 2010/11 outturn was 29.85%.</p> <p>The latest MORI poll results in 2008 showed 87% satisfaction with recycling services within Stockton and 83% satisfaction for communal recycling facilities.</p> |
| | What does inspection tell us about this service? | Previous Best Value inspections by the Audit Commission have given the service the highest possible 3*** service awards. |
| | What resources are used? | <p>There are currently 23 operatives undertaking kerbside recycling duties with additional temporary staff providing cover for holidays and sickness absence. A detailed staffing structure is detailed within this report.</p> <p>In addition to the assets listed below, there are a range of other resources used including buildings and services used at Cowpen Depot and Yarm Road and a variety of specialist equipment.</p> |
| | What assets are used to deliver the current service? | <p>Waste vehicles are the single most valuable asset the service uses. Eight Kerbside vehicles were purchased in 2004 when the service was brought back in house and a depreciation fund is paid through revenue budgets to enable the authority to purchase new vehicles at the end of the lifespan of the kerbsiders.</p> <p>All vehicle purchases are subject to regular and rigorous procurement exercises, that ensure best value is delivered at all times.</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | | <p>Every Household is issued with a blue box for recycling glass, tins and batteries as well as a blue bag for paper – the authority issue around 19,359 bins/bags each year including new properties/participation, replacement and additional bags and boxes.</p> |
| | <p>Are there any limitations or barriers affecting the delivery of the service?</p> | <p>Stockton provides a weekly domestic refuse collection service to all households across the borough and there is no means to impose recycling. This means that residents are only 'encouraged' to recycle and where households choose not to recycle their household waste is collected by means of traditional domestic refuse collections, this has a number of impacts: -</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a limit on the amount of waste that is recycled and where waste is collected by traditional domestic refuse collections there is a risk that the waste could at times be diverted to Landfill – (Landfill sites incur additional travelling times and distances, disposal costs and increased fuel consumption). • There is a cost associated with disposing of traditional waste either at the EFW plant or Landfill site. • Reduced recycling participation will lead to reduced income for the Council. |
| | <p>If the service is outsourced or provided by a third party, how are service standards monitored?</p> | <p>Service standards could in theory be monitored by means of the Client (i.e. SBC) insisting upon certain performance standards that the Contractor must abide by. In reality</p> |

| | | |
|---------------------------------|---|---|
| | | <p>and the experience of waste services that were outsourced until recently, there is little the Client can do to control performance delivered by a wholly separate organisation, other than through formal proceedings, which are time consuming, costly and don't provide the customer with the immediate service improvements required.</p> |
| | <p>Could the service be provided through a different mechanism?</p> | <p>Some European countries only provide communal waste containers as opposed to doorstep collections, although there would need to be an increase in bring site facilities across the borough.</p> <p>In reality, the current arrangements, whilst not perfect, are the most practicable means of providing the service.</p> |
| <p>Customer Baseline</p> | <p>Who are the customers what are their needs now?</p> | <p>There are around 82,000 properties in the Borough and this figure is growing each year, which does place pressure on the service as are no increases in base budgets to allow for property growth. The statutory requirement to collect waste and resident expectations have increased with the recent emphasis on Environmental Impact, the expectation is for additional materials to be collected and for the expansion of recycling provision – in 2009 a plastic and cardboard recycling collection was introduced partly due to demand from residents, following a trial in 2007 the demand for plastic and cardboard recycling was phenomenal with the authority receiving numerous requests as well as petitions to introduce the service.</p> |

| | | |
|--|---|--|
| | <p>How are service users consulted and how do their views shape delivery?</p> <p>How satisfied are the customers?</p> <p>How do you communicate with your users?</p> <p>How are these services promoted / marketed</p> <p>What do Viewpoint Surveys/ internal audit</p> | <p>Residents are consulted on a regular basis using a variety of methods, such as Ipsos Mori surveys, telephone satisfaction surveys, attendance at Resident Association meetings and from Elected Members. Regular information is provided in Stockton News, press releases and the Internet on collection schedules and other important issues.</p> <p>Recent Ipsos Mori satisfaction survey results in 2008 demonstrate that the service has a customer satisfaction rating of 87%</p> <p>Communication through resident meetings, walk the wards, and using the Council's view point is all face to face. There is also an annual leaflet and calendar delivered to every household in the borough as well as regular Stockton News and local press articles. In 2010 the funding for the recycling/waste communications team was removed as a specific means of communication, although the service links in with local events to provide local educational visits and attendance at local shows and events.</p> <p>Again with annual leaflets being distributed to all households in the borough informing them of collection arrangements, through local media and also on advertising on the council's fleet vehicles. In 2009 promotional material was established on Stockton's 'recycling revolution' and the development of a recycling website www.recycleforstockton.gov.uk .</p> <p>Internal and viewpoint surveys have shown an</p> |
|--|---|--|

| | | |
|---------------------------|---|---|
| | reports tell us about the service? | average satisfaction rating of 93.08% and viewpoint members have been actively involved in the expansion of recycling services, from collection methods to the containers we use. The most recent audit of the refuse and recycling service was carried out in March 2011 where the Service was given Substantial Assurance overall. |
| Customer Challenge | <p>Are there customers who could use the service but don't?</p> <p>Are there customers using the service who shouldn't be?</p> <p>Who are the customers of the future and what are their needs?</p> <p>What is likely to impact on demand for these services in the future?</p> | <p>The majority of residents do use the fortnightly recycling collection service provided, though recent research suggests around 51% only use the blue bag service regularly and on a fortnightly basis with 33% using the blue box, although it is also known that around 30% of residents place their recycling out for collection through their own choice less frequently, such as monthly. A contributing factor in this is the ease, choice and reliability of the Council's recycling services and also that residents can still place waste into their wheelie bin for weekly collection.</p> <p>No the kerbside recycling service is available to all households across the borough.</p> <p>Residents of new households in the borough will require access to the recycling facilities, therefore working with planners and architects allows waste and recycling collection issues to be addressed during development design stages.</p> <p>With increasing demand and environmental awareness of residents the trend over the past couple of years has been that more</p> |

| | | |
|---|--|---|
| | <p>What do complaints/ compliments tell you about these services</p> | <p>residents actively and regularly participate in recycling. With the increase in households and the astuteness of residents the increase in recycling participation is expected to increase.</p> <p>Feedback from our customers demonstrates this service is highly valued by residents with only eight residents complaining in 2010/11</p> |
| <p>Aims & Objectives Baseline</p> <p>Challenge</p> | <p>Is the service required by statute?</p> <p>Is there a statutory level of service?</p> <p>Is the service responsive or proactive or a mixture?</p> <p>What would happen if the service was not provided either in whole or part?</p> | <p>Refuse collection is currently a statutory function, and although recycling is not statutory with the global effects on the waste stream and issues around landfill Council's have been under pressure to divert waste and encourage recycling with residents.</p> <p>There is no statutory level of service, i.e weekly, fortnightly, monthly etc.</p> <p>The service is both responsive and proactive as a scheduled collection service is carried out with all residents being aware of their collection day; a proactive service also exists to collect any missed boxes/bags – even when residents have failed to place them out for collection.</p> <p>Waste that was not collected through kerbside recycling would go back into the waste stream and would still need to be collected – this would mean that the current domestic refuse collection service would need to be expanded to take the additional waste. This waste would therefore go to EFW or landfill rather than being recycled – the impact would be that side waste would need to be collected and</p> |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | How would the service react to new pressures? What capacity would be required to deal with additional / new demands? | <p>restrictions of one wheelie bin per property would need to be reviewed. The additional waste in domestic collections would incur a cost for disposal as well as the removal of income for the sale of recycling.</p> <p>Rather than receiving an income for the dry materials collected (£400k 2010/11), additional disposal costs would be incurred. Additional refuse vehicles may be required to collect the additional waste.</p> |
| Aims & Objectives Challenge | Who provides a similar service to this using a different delivery mechanism e.g. external partnerships, shared services etc? | The service can either be delivered through an in-house provision or through an outsourced private contractor, shared services with other local authorities could also be considered. – Some LA do use external providers, although when comparing satisfaction and performance with other Local Authorities in the Tees Valley who use external contract provision the in house service provided by Stockton performs way above that of an external provider. |
| Relevance / Context Baseline / Challenge | <p>How does the service fit with the overall aims of the Council?</p> <p>How does the service contribute to key policy areas?</p> <p>What policies, plans and strategies impact on the service e.g. statutory, policy, function, other services?</p> <p>Are there any political judgements / decisions</p> | <p>The service contributes to both the Sustainable Community Strategy and Council Plan, notably through the following policy area:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Make the Borough a cleaner, greener and more attractive environment. <p>As refuse collection is a statutory function this has an impact on the service in line with the Waste Strategy for England and the Tees Valley Joint Waste Management Strategy</p> <p>As the Service is available to every household</p> |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| | involved in determining the level of service? | in the borough the service has an extremely high profile and is politically sensitive. Reconfiguration of the service has always been determined via scrutiny review/cabinet approval. The Service also comes under the cabinet member for Environment. |
| Financial / Resource Considerations Baseline | <p>What are the costs of the service?</p> <p>Capital and revenue costs?</p> <p>What is the level of 3rd party expenditure?</p> <p>What contracts or other arrangements are in place (spend analysis)?</p> <p>What is the Council's commitment to contracts / other arrangements?</p> <p>Do you have any charging policies?</p> | <p>The kerbside recycling collection budget for 2010/11 is £703,947 the main costs are:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Salaries £699,377 (inc on-costs) • Transport costs £165,523 (of which £69,930 is due to fuel) • Supplies & Services £39,047 <p>The sale of dry material generated income of around £400,000 in 2010/11.</p> <p>All revenue costs.</p> <p>N/A</p> <p>Contracts currently exist with J&B recycling for collections of communal recycling containers and bring sites, J&B recycling also buy Stockton's recycling materials.</p> <p>The council is currently negotiating and tendering for a 3 year contract and also investigating a Tees Valley Wide contract for sale of recycling.</p> <p>There is no charge currently to households for kerbside recycling collections, new and additional recycling receptacles are currently</p> |

| | | |
|--|---|---|
| | <p>How have Gershon efficiency savings impacted on the service and how were the service planning to meet future Gershon efficiency targets?</p> <p>How will the current financial climate affect the service?</p> | <p>offered free of charge with a free delivery service.</p> <p>The greatest risk to the financial stability of the service are those issues that are beyond any control – rising fuel costs, although the plans to look at continual configuration of the rounds for efficiencies as well as continuing with multi-skilled workforce.</p> <p>Reduction in recycling rates (due to customers purchasing less with current financial climate constraints/credit crunch) At the moment the income from sale of recyclables is increasing with current rates at £59.65 per tonne, although income is dependant on fluctuations in the market.</p> |
| Financial / Resource Considerations Challenge | <p>How can you demonstrate that the service is cost effective overall?</p> <p>Do external contracts offer value for money?</p> | <p>Our current performance on recycling collections (including all recycling) is £24.17 cost per household – the average is £22.91 with other local authorities, however this is not directly comparable as other LA's do not offer the full range – this figure was reported as at 09/10 financial year and with the increase in income the cost is expected to reduce.</p> <p>All external supplies and equipment are subject to ongoing and regular procurement exercises. A current tender exercise is also being carried out for sale of recyclables</p> |
| Service Drivers | <p>What do we need to change and why?</p> | <p>The service needs to ensure that collections are as efficient as possible. This means reviewing collection days, ensuring collection routes are well-organised and that the workforce is well trained and motivated. Efficiencies can be made through regular</p> |

| | | |
|--|--------------------------------------|---|
| | What are the main drivers of change? | round configuration. To ensure the service runs efficiently and residents get VFM. |
|--|--------------------------------------|---|